

1-1-2014

## Contents

First Amendment Law Review

Follow this and additional works at: <http://scholarship.law.unc.edu/falr>



Part of the [First Amendment Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

First Amendment Law Review, *Contents*, 12 FIRST AMEND. L. REV. (2014).

Available at: <http://scholarship.law.unc.edu/falr/vol12/iss2/1>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by Carolina Law Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in First Amendment Law Review by an authorized editor of Carolina Law Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact [law\\_repository@unc.edu](mailto:law_repository@unc.edu).

# FIRST AMENDMENT LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 12

WINTER 2014

## ADDRESS

THE FIRST AMENDMENT LAW REVIEW'S ANNUAL SYMPOSIUM:  
A DIALOGUE ON THE LEGACY OF *NEW YORK TIMES CO. V.*

*SULLIVAN* ..... *Ken Paulson* 385

## ARTICLES

WEIGHING CONSTITUTIONAL ANCHORS: *NEW YORK TIMES CO.*  
*V. SULLIVAN* AND THE MISDIRECTION OF FIRST AMENDMENT

DOCTRINE ..... *Ronald A. Cass* 399

REFLECTIONS ON *NEW YORK TIMES CO. V. SULLIVAN*,

50 YEARS LATER ..... *Ashley Messenger* 423

THE FORCE OF A LEGAL CONCEPT: THE STEADY EXTENSION OF THE  
ACTUAL MALICE STANDARD ..... *Nat Stern* 449

## CONTRIBUTING ARTICLES

A PULITZER FROM THE NORTH, A LIBEL SUIT FROM THE SOUTH:  
REACTION TO FOUR SOUTHERN EDITORS' CIVIL RIGHTS

COVERAGE, 1954–1967 ..... *Aimee Edmondson* 461

*NEW YORK TIMES CO. V. SULLIVAN*: NO JOKING MATTER—50 YEARS OF  
PROTECTING HUMOR, SATIRE, AND JOKERS.....*Roy S. Gutterman* 497

REVITALIZING *ROSENBLUM*: THE MATTER OF PUBLIC CONCERN STANDARD  
IN THE AGE OF THE INTERNET .....*Amy K. Sanders, Holly Miller* 529

HOW TO MODESTLY DEFEND A PATENTLY DEFECTIVE

FREE SPEECH RULE.....*R. George Wright* 559



# FIRST AMENDMENT LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 12

WINTER 2014

## BOARD OF EDITORS

### *Editor in Chief*

ETHERIDGE BRITTIN RICKS

### *Executive Editor*

KELLY A. CRECCO

### *Chief Article and Note Editor*

SIDNEY L. FOWLER

### *Publication Editor*

BELAL ELRAHAL

### *Managing Editor*

CHARLOTTE R. STEWART

### *Communication Editor*

SATIE R. MUNN

### *Symposium Editors*

CANDRA K. BAIZAN

ANDERSON A. CHANG

## ARTICLE AND NOTE EDITORS

GINA C. LEBLANC

PORSHA M. ROBINSON

DANIEL N. MULLINS

JUSTICE D. WARREN

MINISHA D. PATEL

RYAN FAIRCHILD

LAURA ACKERMAN

BRIAN WILLET

LOGAN LILES

## WRITING STAFF

ASHLEY L. ANDERSON

BRIAN M. BLOOD

CHARLOTTE M. DAVIS

BRANDON C. ELLIOT

ASIA E. HESTER

ERIN L. LOCKER

MELISSA J. MITCHELL

DAVID C. SEASTRUNK

JOHN W. TUCKER

FREDERICK E. BENZ

LAURE E. BURKETT

EISSABETH K. DIZON

KATHERINE A. GARDZALLA

NEAL A. INMAN

TUCKER B. KASS

KATHLEEN A. LOCKWOOD

ANNA ORR

MARY K. VARNER

ASHLEY L. BERGER

RABEE R. EL-JAOUHARI

CAROLINE C. HALL

TAYLOR A. JOHNSON

SHANG-YUN LIN

SAFA SAJADI

PHILIP A. THOMPSON

## FACULTY ADVISORS

WILLIAM P. MARSHALL, *William Rand Kenan, Jr. Distinguished Professor of Law*

*The views expressed in signed contributions to the Review do not necessarily reflect the opinions of the Board of Editors.*

## THE UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA SCHOOL OF LAW

### *Administration*

THOMAS W. ROSS, B.S., J.D., *President of the University of North Carolina*  
JOHN CHARLES BOGER, A.B., M.Div., J.D., *Dean and Wade Edwards Distinguished Professor of Law*  
ROBERT P. MOSTELLER, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and J. Dickson Phillips Distinguished Professor of Law*  
RICHARD E. MYERS II, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Student Affairs and George R. Ward Associate Professor of Law*  
JOAN H. KRAUSE, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Faculty Development and Dan K. Moore Distinguished Professor of Law; Professor of Social Medicine in the School of Medicine; Adjunct Professor in the Gillings School of Global Public Health*  
CRAIG T. SMITH, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Assistant Dean for Legal Writing and Academic Success and Clinical Professor of Law*  
PATRICIA HENNESSEY, B.S., *Associate Dean for Finance and Information Technology*  
KRISTINE JENSEN, B.A., *Associate Dean for Advancement*  
MICHAEL J. STATES, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Admissions*  
SYLVIA K. NOVINSKY, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Public Service Programs*  
JOHN B. KASPRZAK, B.A., M.A.T., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Services*  
DOUGLAS B. EDMUNDS, B.A., M.S., *Assistant Dean for Information Technology*  
CATHERINE PIERCE, B.A., M.P.A., *Assistant Dean for Policy and Special Assistant to the Dean*  
BRIAN D. LEWIS, B.G.S., M.A., *Assistant Dean for Career Services*  
ALLISON L. REID, B.A., M.A., *Assistant Dean for Communications*  
T. BRANDON WRIGHT, B.S., *Assistant Dean for Advancement*

### *Faculty*

DAVID S. ARDIA, B.S., M.S., J.D., LL.M., *Assistant Professor Law and Journalism and Mass Communication*  
VOLKER BEHR, LL.M., PH.D., *HABILITATION, Visiting Professor of Law*  
TAMAR R. BIRCKHEAD, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
KIMBERLY C. BISHOP, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
JOHN CHARLES BOGER, A.B., M.Div., J.D., *Dean and Wade Edwards Distinguished Professor of Law*  
LISSA LAMKIN BROOME, B.S., J.D., *Wells Fargo Professor of Banking Law and Director of the Center for Banking and Finance*  
ALFRED L. BROPHY, A.B., J.D., A.M., PH.D., *Judge John J. Parker Distinguished Professor of Law*  
CAROLINE NICHOLSON BROWN, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
PATRICIA L. BRYAN, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Martha Brandis Professor of Law*  
BERNARD A. BURK, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
SUZANNE M. CHESTER, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
ALEXA Z. CHEW, A.B., J.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
ANDREW CHIN, B.S., PH.D., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
LAURA COLLINS BRITTON, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
JOHN MARTIN CONLEY, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *William Rand Kenan Jr. Professor of Law*  
MICHAEL L. CORRADO, B.A., B.S., A.M., PH.D., J.D., *Arch T. Allen Distinguished Professor of Law*  
JOHN F. COYLE, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
KAREEM U. CRAYTON, A.B., PH.D., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
CHARLES EDWARD DAYE, B.A., J.D., *Henry Brandis Professor of Law and Deputy Director of the Center for Civil Rights*  
JOSHUA EAGLE, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*  
MAXINE N. EICHNER, B.A., J.D., M.A., PH.D., *Reef C. Ivey II Professor of Law*  
LEWIS MOORE EVERETT, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
BARBARA A. FEDDERS, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
VICTOR B. FLATT, B.A., J.D., *Thomas F. and Elizabeth Taft Distinguished Professor in Environmental Law and Director of the Center for Law, Environment, Adaptation and Resources (CLEAR)*  
TIMOTHY J. GALLINA, B.A., J.D., M.L.I.S., *Reference Librarian and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
LAURA N. GASAWAY, B.A., M.L.S., J.D., *Paul B. Eaton Distinguished Professor of Law*  
DEBORAH R. GERHARDT, A.B., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
MICHAEL J. GERHARDT, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Samuel Ashe Distinguished Professor in Constitutional Law and Director of the Center for Law and Government*  
S. ELIZABETH GIBSON, B.A., J.D., *Burton Craige Professor of Law*  
MARGARET F. HALL, B.A., M.L.I.S., J.D., *Reference and Student Services Librarian and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
AARON R. HARMON, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
THOMAS LEE HAZEN, B.A., J.D., *Cary C. Boshamer Distinguished Professor of Law*  
JEFFREY MICHAEL HIRSCH, B.A., M.P.P., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
AMANDA S. HITCHCOCK, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
DONALD THOMAS HORNSTEIN, B.A., J.D., *Aubrey L. Brooks Professor of Law*  
MELISSA B. JACOBY, B.A., J.D., *Graham Kenan Professor of Law*

THOMAS A. KELLEY, III, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law and Director of Clinical Programs*  
 JOSEPH E. KENNEDY, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
 CATHERINE Y. KIM, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
 JULIE L. KIMBROUGH, B.A., J.D., M.L.S., *Assistant Director for Collection Services and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 P. ANNE KLINEFELTER, B.A., M.L.S., J.D., *Director of Law Library and Associate Professor of Law*  
 JOAN H. KRAUSE, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Faculty Development and Dan K. Moore Distinguished Professor of Law; Professor of Social Medicine in the School of Medicine; Adjunct Professor in the Gillings School of Global Public Health*  
 HOLNING S. LAU, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
 ANNE LOOIJESTIJN-CLEARIE, B.A., M.A., LL.M., *Visiting Professor of Law*  
 WILLIAM P. MARSHALL, B.A., J.D., *William Rand Kenan Jr Distinguished Professor of Law*  
 JON PAUL MCCLANAHAN, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law and Director of Academic Success Programs*  
 STEVEN J. MELAMUT, B.A., B.S., J.D., M.S.L.S., *Information Technology Services Librarian and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 ROBERT P. MOSTELLER, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and J. Dickson Phillips Distinguished Professor of Law*  
 ERIC L. MULLER, A.B., J.D., *Dan K. Moore Distinguished Professor of Law in Jurisprudence and Ethics and Director of UNC Center for Faculty Excellence*  
 RICHARD E. MYERS II, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Student Affairs and George R. Ward Associate Professor of Law*  
 GENE R. NICHOL, B.A., J.D., *Boyd Tinsley Distinguished Professor of Law and Director of the Center on Poverty, Work and Opportunity*  
 DONNA L. NIXON, B.S., J.D., M.S.L.S., *Electronic Resources Librarian and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 SAULE T. OMAROVA, PH.D., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
 JOHN V. ORTH, A.B., J.D., M.A., PH.D., *William Rand Kenan Jr. Professor of Law*  
 MARY-ROSE PAPANDREA, A.B., J.D., *Visiting Associate Professor of Law*  
 GREGG D. POLSKY, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Willie Person Mangum Professor of Law*  
 GERALD J. POSTEMA, A.B., M.A., PH.D., *Cary C. Boshamer Professor of Philosophy and Professor of Law*  
 KATIE ROSE GUEST PRYAL, A.B., M.A., J.D., PH.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 ALICE A. RATLIFF, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Law*  
 DANA A. REMUS, A.B., J.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*  
 KATHRYN A. SABBETH, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
 OSCAR J. SALINAS, B.A., J.D., M.A., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 SARA A. SAMPSON, B.S., J.D., M.L.I.S., *Deputy Director of the Law Library and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 MELISSA SAUNDERS, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
 MARIA SAVASTA-KENNEDY, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Law and Director of the Externship Program*  
 RICHARD S. SAVER, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law and Professor of Social Medicine in the School of Medicine; Adjunct Professor in the Gillings School of Global Public Health*  
 NICK SEXTON, B.A., J.D., M.S.L.S., *Reference and Information Delivery Services Librarian and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 JAMES W. SHERWOOD, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.L.I.S., *Reference/Foreign and International Law Librarian and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 CRAIG T. SMITH, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Assistant Dean for Legal Writing and Academic Success and Clinical Professor of Law*  
 ROBERT J. SMITH, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
 LESLIE A. STREET, B.A., J.D., M.L.I.S., *Assistant Director of Public Services of the Law Library and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*  
 WILLIAM J. TURNIER, B.S., M.A., J.D., *Willie Person Mangum Professor of Law*  
 JUDITH WELCH WEGNER, B.A., J.D., *Burton Craige Professor of Law*  
 W. MARK C. WEIDEMAIER, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
 ARTHUR MARK WEISBURD, A.B., J.D., *Reef C. Ivey II Distinguished Professor of Law*  
 DEBORAH M. WEISSMAN, B.A., J.D., *Reef C Ivey II Distinguished Professor of Law*  
 ERIKA WILSON, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
 JANINE M. ZANIN, B.A., J.D., *Faculty Supervisor of Externship Programs and Clinical Assistant Professor of Law*

### *Adjunct Faculty*

MICHAEL R. ABEL, A.B., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 MICHAEL W. BALLANCE, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 SETH A. BLUM, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 ELIZABETH BRASWELL, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 ERIC J. BRIGNAC, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Associate Professor of Law*  
 JONATHAN E. BROUN, B.PH., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 JOSEPH H. BYLINSKI, B.A., M.B.A., PH.D., *Adjunct Associate Professor of Law*  
 MARY BETH CHOPAS, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law*

JOANNA CAREY CLEVELAND, B.A., J.D., M.P.A., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 FELICE M. CORPENING, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 KEARNS DAVIS, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 THE HONORABLE M. PATRICIA DEVINE, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 MARK E. DOROSIN, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 JAMES C. DRENNAN, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 AMY FLANARY-SMITH, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law*  
 JAMES C. FULLER, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 ANTHONY GAETA, JR., B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 DAVID L. HARRISON, B.S., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 R. HARPER HECKMAN, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 NORMA HOUSTON, B.S., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 MALCOLM HUNTER, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 ROBERT O. JENKINS, B.A., M.P.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 SALLY C. JOHNSON, B.S., M.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 VALERIE A. JOHNSON, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 THE HONORABLE ABRAHAM JONES, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 MICHAEL G. KADENS, A.B., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 SEBASTIAN KIELMANOVICH, J.D., J.D., *Adjunct Associate Professor of Law*  
 KELLIE D. MANNETTE, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law*  
 THE HONORABLE MARK D. MARTIN, B.S., B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 WILLIAM S. MILLS, A.B., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 JOHN M. MOYE, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law*  
 SAMUEL T. OLIVER, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 THE HONORABLE ROBERT F. ORR, A.B., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 DAVID W. OWENS, B.A., M.R.P., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 J. DICKSON PHILLIPS, III, A.B., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 BETH POSNER, A.B., M.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 SCOTT L. SILLIMAN, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 ELLIOT M. SILVERSTEIN, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 THOMAS M. STERN, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 KATHERINE TOPULOS, B.A., M.A., M.S.L.S., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 DEVON WHITE, A.A.S., B.A., M.A., J.D., *Adjunct Associate Professor of Law*  
 GORDON WIDENHOUSE, A.B., M.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*  
 MELVIN F. WRIGHT JR., B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*

### *Faculty Emeriti*

WILLIAM BRANTLEY AYCOCK, B.A., A.M., J.D., LL.D., *Kenan Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 KENNETH S. BROWN, B.S., J.D., *Henry Brandis Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 HARRY E. GROVES, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Henry Brandis Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 PAUL HARDIN, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 PAUL G. HASKELL, A.B., J.D., LL.B., *William Rand Kenan, Jr. Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 JOSEPH JOHN KALO, B.A., J.D., *Graham Kenan Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 RONALD CHARLES LINK, A.B., M.A., J.D., *Dan K. Moore Distinguished Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 ARNOLD H. LOEWY, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Graham Kenan Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 RUTH ANN MCKINNEY, B.A., M.Ed., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Law Emeritus*  
 RICHARD A. ROSEN, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law Emeritus*

---

The *First Amendment Law Review* is published three times a year by the First Amendment Law Review.

**Subscriptions:** Annual subscriptions are \$40.00 per year (domestic). Subscriptions are accepted for complete volumes only and will be renewed automatically unless the subscriber provides adequate notice of cancellation. Notification as to change of address should include both the old and new addresses and should be made at least one month before publication date to ensure prompt delivery. Subscriptions and address changes should be directed to the Communications Editor at the following address:

First Amendment Law Review  
The University of North Carolina School of Law  
100 Ridge Road, CB# 3380  
3002 Van Hecke-Wettach Hall  
Chapel Hill, North Carolina 27599-3380  
(919) 843-6683  
falr@unc.edu

**Single and Back Issues:** Volumes 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, and 10 may be purchased from the *Review* for \$30.00 per issue (domestic).

**Manuscripts:** The *Review* invites the submission of unsolicited manuscripts. Manuscripts cannot be returned unless accompanied by a self-addressed, postage-paid envelope. Correspondence and manuscripts should be directed to the Editor in Chief.

**Copyright:** Copyright © 2013 by the North Carolina Law Review Association. Except as otherwise provided, permission is hereby granted for copies of each article to be made for classroom use, provided that: (1) all copies are distributed at or below cost, (2) the author and the *First Amendment Law Review* are identified, (3) proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy, and (4) the *First Amendment Law Review* is notified of the use.

**Publication Information:** The *Review* is printed by Joe Christensen, Inc. of Lincoln, Nebraska. The text and citations in Volume 10 conform generally to THE BLUEBOOK: A UNIFORM SYSTEM OF CITATION (Columbia Law Review Ass'n et al. eds, 19th ed. 2010).

**Cite as: FIRST AMEND. L. REV.**

[www.firstamendmentlawreview.org](http://www.firstamendmentlawreview.org)



The Board of Editors would like to thank the following individuals  
and organizations for their support of the  
*First Amendment Law Review*:

Dean John Charles Boger

Associate Dean Robert P. Mosteller

Professor William P. Marshall

Professor Arnold H. Loewy

Associate Dean Eric L. Muller

Assistant Dean John B. Kasprzak

Assistant Dean Louise Harris

Student Services Coordinator Elizabeth Dorsey Bachenheimer

University of North Carolina Center for  
Media Law & Policy

Graduate and Professional Student Federation of the University of  
North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Student Bar Association

Student Congress of the University of North Carolina at  
Chapel Hill

North Carolina Law Review

North Carolina Banking Institute

North Carolina Journal of International Law and  
Commercial Regulation

North Carolina Journal of Law and Technology

and the many alumni of First Amendment Law Review and UNC  
School of Law who helped build and continue to support this  
publication.